

IJSHS

The INTERNATIONAL
JOURNAL of
**SUSTAINABLE
HUMAN SECURITY**

IJSHS
VOLUME 2 (2014-2015)
Number 1 (December)

Special topic:
**Anti-Human
Trafficking for Human
Security**

Co-Editors:
Marco Tavanti
Charles E. Tucker
Gregory J. Wangerin



A PEER-REVIEWED ANNUAL
ELECTRONIC PUBLICATION OF THE
WORLD ENGAGEMENT INSTITUTE

IJSHS

International Journal of Sustainable Human Security

Special Topic

Anti-Human Trafficking for Human Security

Volume 2, Year 2014-2015

Number 1 (December)

Editors

Marco Tavanti

University of San Francisco

Charles E. Tucker

World Engagement Institute

Gregory J. Wangerin

World Engagement Institute

A publication of the World Engagement Institute

Published online on December 30, 2015

ISSN 2311-5920 (electronic version)

Key title: International Journal of Sustainable Human Security

Abbreviated key title: Int. j. sustain. hum. secur.

Online access: www.weinstitute.org/ijshs

ORIGINAL PAPER¹

Partnership and the 3Ps of Human Trafficking: How Multi-Sector Collaboration Contributes to Effective Anti-Trafficking Measures

Kelly Ann Yeo-Oxenham²
Dylan Rose Schneider³

Abstract: *This paper reviews the relevance of partnership in the anti-human trafficking globally adopted 3P strategy of prevention, protection and persecution. It proposes concrete recommendations for implementing cross-sector partnerships as a more effective response and holistic strategy to the challenges of modern day slavery. The fourth “P”, Partnership, was added to the widely practiced “3Ps” paradigm of human trafficking by former Secretary of State Hillary Rodham Clinton in 2009 in the attempt of promoting anti human trafficking solutions through pooled resources and collaborative strategies.*

Introduction

The issue of Human Trafficking has gained significant traction in recent years, becoming one of the major concerns of both governments and organizations working in policy areas from human rights to gender services. Consider that 117 countries from Albania to Zambia have

¹ Citation: Yeo-Oxenham, Kelly Ann & Schneider, Dylan Rose. “Partnership and the 3Ps of Human Trafficking: How Multi-Sector Collaboration Contributes to Effective Anti-Trafficking Measures.” *International Journal of Sustainable Human Security (IJSHS)*. Volume 2, Number 1 (Year 2014-2015): 102-116. weininstitute.org/ijshs

² Kelly Ann Yeo holds a Master of Nonprofit Administration (MNA) from the University of San Francisco where she conducted research human rights, anti-trafficking efforts, and sexual exploitation of women and children. She is a native of Singapore and a Sociology graduate from the National University of Singapore.

³ Dylan Rose Schneider holds a Masters in Public Administration (MPA) from the University of San Francisco. She is Social Impact Fellow with Rudolph Steiner Foundation of Social Finance and a Research Fellow with International Development Exchange (IDEX). She lectures at University of Utah’s Graduate Environmental Humanities Program. social impact fellow with Rudolph Steiner foundation of social finance and a research fellow with IDEX.

signed the UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons (often referred to as the Palermo Protocol) and that the first ever United Nations World Day Against Trafficking in Persons was held on July 30 2014. This is testament to the growing political will to combat the scourge of human trafficking. Yet, it seems trafficking in persons remains all too common, and consequences for traffickers woefully insufficient. According to the 2014 Global Report on Trafficking in Persons, between 2010 and 2012, about 40 per cent of countries reported less than 10 convictions per year while 15 per cent of the 128 countries covered in the report did not even record a single conviction.⁴ This is in spite of an increase in detected incidences of human trafficking and a burgeoning anti-trafficking movement around the world. Evidently, the globally adopted 3P strategy of prevention, protection and persecution is inadequate as a response to the challenges of modern day slavery and a more holistic strategy is necessary to combat this heinous crime.

In 2009, a fourth “P”, Partnership, was added to the widely practiced “3Ps” paradigm of human trafficking by former Secretary of State Hillary Rodham Clinton.⁵ Clinton recognized the impact international multi-sector collaboration could have on effectively combatting human trafficking through pooled resources and collaborative strategy. Yet, cross-sector collaboration and partnerships is hardly a new phenomenon. In fact, it has dominated public management and private sector best practices for the last decade, emerging in response to the towering number of urgent social problems, loss of trust in government, emergence of the millennial generation, or the dawning realization that as globalization continues to shrink our world, our actions (and problems) are no longer isolated. *“People who want to tackle tough social problems and achieve beneficial community outcomes are beginning to understand that multiple sectors of a democratic society —business, nonprofits and philanthropies, the media, the community, and government — must collaborate to deal effectively and humanely with the challenges”*.⁶

By examining current examples of how multi-sector partnerships have contributed to more impactful solutions, we seek to discover why the 4th P of partnership remains the most challenging dimension of the 4P framework to implement. Moreover, this paper will provide tangible multi-sector recommendations that are applicable in any sector, and are therefore categorized by the following overarching themes: level five leadership, collaborative cooperation and education.

Human Trafficking and the 4P Framework

For the purpose of this paper, we will defer to the definition of Human Trafficking as specified in the Palermo Protocol: the “recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons using the means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of

⁴ “2014 Global Report on Trafficking in Persons”, accessed January 9 2015,

<http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/global-report-on-trafficking-in-persons.html>

⁵ “Funding Situation of Anti-Trafficking Organizations: The Four “Ps” Paradigm”, accessed January 27, 2015,

<http://anti-traffickingorgfunding.weebly.com/4ps-framework.html>

⁶ Bryson et al, “The Design and Implementation of Cross-Sector Collaborations”, *Articles on Collaborative Public Management*, 46.

the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person for the purpose of exploitation”.⁷ As this paper adopts the lens of the victim-centered approach in its examination and subsequent recommendations, it is important to clarify that the victim-centered approach refers to providing trafficked victims with protection and support in order to acknowledge and respond to the human rights abuse that they have suffered as a result of being trafficked, and ensures that they will not be treated as criminals themselves.⁸ It allows victims the chance to recover from their trafficking ordeal and reduces the risk of re-trafficking. Through the provision of protection and support, trafficked victims can gain the confidence and security to provide evidence against their traffickers during the criminal investigation.

Referring to the themes of prevention, victim protection and criminal prosecution, the 3Ps is an internationally recognized framework in the eradication strategy. Prevention includes “increasing public awareness of the signs of trafficking, enacting and enforcing laws, particularly in key sectors where trafficking is most typically found, and increasing collaboration and communication among state and local government agencies and victim services organizations”.⁹ Building upon the foundations of prevention are initiatives to protect victims of trafficking through rescue, rehabilitation and reintegration services. This could range from governments permitting victims to stay in-country to obtain services and/or work without fear of deportation, to longer-term services such as safe housing, access to educational and economic resources and even repatriation for those that wish to return home. Just as crucial in this multi-pronged strategy is the indispensable paradigm of prosecution. Guidelines articulated in both the Palermo Protocol and the United State’s Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) provides governments with some basic courses of action in dealing with those who traffic in persons. For example, the Department of State (D.O.S) in its evaluation of nations for its annual Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Report looks at whether a maximum prison sentence of at least four years is imposed for the crime of trafficking in persons.¹⁰ Since the adoption of the Palermo Protocol and the enactment of TVPA in 2000, many nations have aligned or are at least in the process of aligning their anti-trafficking response according to these three elements.

The 4th P, Partnerships, was added in response to the shared sentiment that trafficking in persons is a “fluid phenomenon that responds to market demands”¹¹, a trans-national crime that thrives on weaknesses in laws and penalties, takes advantage of economic disparities, and operates in plain sight. While it is too soon to accurately ascertain the outcome of addition of the fourth P, it can be argued that the tangible results of such idealistic partnerships have yet to be fully realized.

⁷ What is Human Trafficking? January 20, 2015, <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/what-is-human-trafficking.html>.

⁸ UN GIFT, “007 Workshop: From Protection to Prosecution - A Strategic Approach” (paper presented at The Vienna Forum To Fight Human Trafficking, Vienna, Austria, February 13-15, 2008).

⁹ Price, Susan, “OLR Research Report”, Hartford: Office of Legislative Research, 2012

¹⁰ U.S Department of State Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking In Persons, “The 3Ps: Prevention, Protection, Prosecution Fact Sheet”, accessed January 20 2015, <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/194932.pdf>

¹¹ Luis CdeBaca, The Global Fight Against Human Trafficking: Ten Years After Palermo, University of Luxembourg, October 14, 2010, <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/rm/2010/149474.htm>

Recommendations

I. Facilitate Level-5 Leadership

For cross-sector collaborations to be effectively created, implemented and managed, innovative and strategic leadership is needed. Jim Collins in his book, “Good to Great” defines a Level 5 Leader as someone who is characterized by *“humility, and they don’t seek success for their own glory; rather, success is necessary so that the team and organization can thrive. They share credit for success, and they’re the first to accept blame for mistakes”*.¹² Through the findings of this paper, Level 5 Leaders must possess the courage to seek and foster partnerships beyond their sectors, and champions the victim-rights approach by integrating it into decisions, policies and programs.

Ia. Foster Multi-Sector Partnerships

We see such examples of level 5 leadership in Pope Francis and former Secretary of State Hillary Clinton who boldly expressed the need for the public sector to forge partnerships with the private sector to successfully prosecute traffickers. *“When it comes to fighting crime there has to be a partnership between the public and the private sectors. Crime prevention and victim protection cannot be achieved by governments or criminal justice systems alone; we need Internet service providers, civil society, the media, educational institutions and the public on board”*.¹³ The public sector is infamous for its lagging technology and mired bureaucracy that often stands in the way of innovative and responsive programming; obstacles not as common in the private silo. It is therefore crucial that public sector leaders not only accept, but also proactively seek, private sector partnerships.

In 2013, the government agency National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC) partnered with the software company Palantir Technologies to improve NCMEC’s ability to search for and analyze information relating to missing and exploited children and sex offenders. This partnership enhanced NCMEC’s analytics and allowed it to share pertinent data with law enforcement and other partners. A year prior, the same company had also initiated a partnership with Polaris Project to provide the analytical platform, training, and support resources to the National Human Trafficking Resource Centre to enable the study and application of data derived from their call records.¹⁴

Ib. Adopt a Victim-Centric Approach in Current Programming and Policies

Level 5 leaders recognize that adopting a victim-centered approach cannot be an individualized effort; it requires the integration, communication, and involvement of

¹² Mind Tools, “Level 5 Leadership”. Accessed January 27, 2015. <http://www.mindtools.com/pages/article/level-5-leadership.htm>

¹³ University of Southern California. “Technology & Human Trafficking”. 2011. Accessed January 26, 2015. <http://technologyandtrafficking.usc.edu/report/future-action-for-trafficking-online/>

¹⁴ Palantir Technologies, “Impact Study: Helping to Find and Rescue Missing and Exploited Children”, Accessed January 20 2015, www.palantir.com/wp-content/static/pg-analysis-blog/2011/11/ImpactStudy_NCMEC.pdf

government, non-government, private, faith-based and community-based organizations. Successful integration of victim-centered approach in current programs and policies depends upon level five leaders that have the courage to disrupt longstanding status quo “solutions” that often act as short-term band aids rather than long-term solutions.

An excellent example of this practice in action is the International Development Law Organization (IDLO), that embraces a victim-centric approach as one of its core values and basis of its programming. Governments, multilateral organizations and private foundations support the work of IDLO as they “enable countries to design, reform and strengthen those laws and institutions most apt to deliver justice, dignity and economic opportunity” always within a victim-centric perspective.¹⁵ Currently, IDLO is working in partnership with the European Union’s EURO social program to strengthen access to justice for victims of trafficking in Chile. They are actively assisting Chile’s Ministry of Justice (MOJ) to coordinate orientation services and legal assistance to better protect and empower the most vulnerable. Simultaneously, IDLO is working with staff from Corporaciones de Asistencia Judicial (CAJ), a Chilean government backed legal aid office by sending them to international best practice conferences in Spain to provide them with comprehensive trainings in how to best assist and advocate for victims as well as how to respect the rights and dignity of victims that are often compromised subconsciously during monotonous paperwork and legal procedures. IDLO has also worked with governments to facilitate agreements between various Latin American countries to allow repatriation of trafficking victims to neighboring countries if there is risk associated with returning to their country of origin. Such initiatives demonstrate an understanding that successful long-term solutions come from empowering current systems to move past blanket policies that do not effectively combat trafficking because they were not created to address the needs of the victim.

In another example, private sector leaders from companies including Coca Cola, Microsoft, Ford, Delta and others started the Global Business Alliance against Human Trafficking as a way for private sector companies get involved in the fight to end modern slavery. This proactive assemblage of private sector leaders can be seen as a manifestation that business as usual practices are changing, especially in the private sector. Private sector leaders are confident and eager to lend their immense resources to finding innovative solutions to wicked problems like human trafficking.

2. Collaborative Cooperation

Multi-sector partnerships have the potential to provide increased access to a breadth of resources for all participants. Referring to resources in the form of financial efficiency, programmatic sustainability, and data sharing, the benefits of broader access to resources can only be accrued to those who view these partnerships as a mutually beneficial endeavor.

¹⁵ “International Development Law Organization”, last modified 2014, <http://www.idlo.int/>.

2a. Financial Efficiency

In a recent survey of trafficking victims service providers, 96 percent cited “*lack of adequate funding*” as a barrier in providing services.¹⁶ Inadequate funding affects not just NGOs but governments too. More importantly, it determines the range of services available, the quality of services offered, the number of people it can be offered to, the level and amount of staff training and in some cases, the decision to cancel an otherwise effective program. To compound this problem, the dearth of methodologically sound research showing which anti-trafficking efforts are ethical and which are not, leads to wasted precious resources spent on practices that yield no progress.¹⁷

The impact of this is most apparent when one considers the severe shortage of shelter beds available to trafficking victims. In all of North America, there are only 2,173 beds for victims, of which only 31 percent (678 beds) are designated exclusively for trafficking victims.¹⁸ In California, there were 683 reported cases of human trafficking in 2014, yet only 385 shelter beds were available statewide - all of them operated by private nonprofits.¹⁹ This is hardly surprising. In San Francisco alone, the city faces a budget deficit of \$522 million and simply cannot afford to spend on increased anti-trafficking efforts.²⁰ It does not help that trafficking is but one of the many human rights issues on the policy agenda. In a report prepared for the Mayor of San Francisco, one of the recommendations made was for more safe places and housing for trafficking victims “if funding becomes available”.²¹ Sadly, the bed shortage is just one example of how inadequate funding presents huge barriers in providing services to trafficking victims.

Private-public partnerships, or PPPs, with the private sector playing the role of financial investor, is one vehicle that could certainly ease the financial burden on governments and nonprofits. In fact, this is a model that is already being utilized in the provision of services to the homeless. The foreclosure crisis of 2010 greatly increased the country’s vacant housing stock. Rather than incur taxes and added costs associated with these properties, some banks choose to donate these properties over to the city. According to a Business Insider article, JPMorgan Chase has donated roughly 3,300 homes to nonprofits or municipalities since 2009; Citibank donated 205 properties in 2011, while Wells Fargo gave 100 properties to the Cuyahoga

¹⁶ Georgetown University, “*Providers of Service to Victims of Trafficking: A Study for Catholic Charities USA*”, Georgetown University Center for Applied Research (2013), Accessed January 20 2015, <http://www.scribd.com/doc/166020189/2013-Providers-of-Service-to-Victims-of-Trafficking-Full-Report-CARA>

¹⁷ Esarey, David, “*Funding Priorities in Human Trafficking*”, 2014, Accessed January 20 2015, <http://humantraffickingcenter.org/posts-by-htc-associates/funding-priorities-in-human-trafficking/>

¹⁸ Polaris Project, “Shelter Beds For Human Trafficking victims in the United States.” *Polaris Project*, 2012, accessed January 20 2015, <http://www.ywcagreaterbaltimore.org/images/shelter%20beds%20for%20human%20trafficking%20victims.pdf>

¹⁹ Polaris Project, “Statistics by State”, 2014, accessed January 20 2015, <http://www.traffickingresourcecenter.org/state/california>

²⁰ Frey, Christine, “*A Comprehensive Approach to Combating Human Trafficking in San Francisco*” (PhD Diss., Berkeley: Goldman School of Public Policy, 2010).

²¹ Frey, “A Comprehensive.”

County Land Reutilization Corporation.²² Under the Title V program (part of the McKinney-Vento Homeless Assistance Act), the federal government then requires these empty or "underused" properties that it owns be made available to homelessness advocacy organizations.²³ Between 1988 and 2003, 91 such properties (worth some \$105.4 million) were handed over to help the homeless.²⁴ It is likely that this model can be replicated within the anti-trafficking services sub-sector, where vacant housing stock and other empty properties can be converted into shelter beds and safe houses for victims.

2b. Programmatic Sustainability

Cooperation within and across sectors can also bring about the benefit of programmatic sustainability. Often times, the status of programs is left in limbo once the initial funding expires and tough decisions must be made about whether to continue the program at the expense of another. The Navigation Center, an innovative homeless-help service model currently being tested in San Francisco, provides another example of a model that has the potential to be replicated within the anti-trafficking space.²⁵ Funded entirely by a \$2 million anonymous donation, the Navigation Center is fitted with dormitories, laundry rooms, counseling rooms, and pet and storage areas. It is a novel project designed to move entire homeless encampments from sidewalk to permanent homes in just 10 days.²⁶ To be sure, its innovation goes beyond its 'one-stop nature' to the fact that it is a shelter open 24 hours a day (as opposed to the usual 'sunset to sunrise' hours of operation) and relocation plans involve moving entire encampments together. The move to include extended hours and relocating the homeless in their informally-established social groups is an innovative strategy that could help build trust and convince those who have historically been reluctant to use city services to relocate. The key takeaways from this pilot project is its aid model: it relies on inter-agency cooperation in the public sector to explore alternatives beyond criminalization as a solution, and works with other aid providers to develop a program that is relevant and appropriate to the population it serves. Additionally, as a result of being housed in the same facility, these agencies no longer need to compete for the same grants, and they get to enjoy the economies of scale that collaboration brings.

The Human Exploitation and Trafficking (H.E.A.T) Watch blueprint is another example of how collaborative partnerships can be instrumental in creating an effective approach to combat human trafficking that is both victim-centric and sustainable. H.E.A.T. Watch is "*a joint effort of various agencies, disciplines, and individuals, facilitated by the leadership of Alameda County*

²² Amanda Erickson, "Here's Why We Can't Just Put Homeless Families In Foreclosed Homes", Business Insider, June 28 2012, accessed March 12 2015, <http://www.businessinsider.com/heres-why-we-cant-just-put-homeless-families-in-foreclosed-homes-2012-6#ixzz3U9yHQaj>

²³ Erickson, "Here's Why."

²⁴ Erickson, "Here's Why."

²⁵ Kevin Fagan, "S.F. takes new direction on homeless camps with 1-stop aid center", SF Gate, January 24 2015, accessed March 12 2015, <http://www.sfgate.com/bayarea/article/S-F-takes-new-direction-on-homeless-camps-with-6038197.php>

²⁶ Fagan, "SF takes."

District in California Attorney Nancy E. O'Malley".²⁷ It is a five-point collaborative strategy providing a comprehensive response involving:

- 1) Robust community engagement
- 2) Training for and sensitization of law enforcement
- 3) Vigorous prosecution
- 4) Education of and advocacy to policy makers
- 5) Wrap-around services for victim/survivors.

Since January 2006, H.E.A.T Watch has achieved tremendous success – with 325 human trafficking cases charged and an 86 percent overall conviction rate.²⁸ Part of the reason for their success is the commitment to a collaborative effort that elicits the help of the existing stakeholders in the community from ordinary citizens, nonprofits serving victims and local businesses. Building upon this supportive network, H.E.A.T Watch then assesses the level of awareness within the community about the issue of human trafficking before launching a targeted awareness campaign. Additionally, they have established working partnerships with victim service agencies around the county such as California-based Motivating, Inspiring, Supporting & Serving Sexually Exploited Youths (MISSEY) that provides case management and mentorship services to formerly trafficked youths, DreamCatcher Shelter also based in California - an emergency drop-in center and shelter for teenage runaways (an especially vulnerable population), and is part of the San Francisco Collaborative Action Against Human Trafficking (SFCaHT) Coalition. Further south, in Phoenix, another initiative that is revolutionizing the response to trafficking is Project Rose. Offered as an alternative to jail and a prostitution charge, this diversion program offers those who have been picked up by the police in sting operations a suite of services from housing, medical help, substance abuse therapy to counselors to guide them through the rehabilitation process. It signals a shift in law enforcement response - of local police agencies working with faith-based organizations, community-based organizations and federal officials. The diversion program offers victims a respite, many of whom then gain the strength to provide the incriminating testimony law enforcement requires to build a case against their traffickers. This is a reality that would have been impossible had they been charged with prostitution and sent to jail.²⁹ Both these models allow victim-serving professionals, public administrators and community members to team up in maximizing anti-trafficking initiatives that help ensure the victims rights at their very core.

²⁷"The H.E.A.T Watch Blueprint", Alameda County District Attorney's Office, accessed January 12 2015, http://www.heat-watch.org/heat_watch/

²⁸ "H.E.A.T Watch Blueprint."

²⁹ Ruelas Richard, "Sex Trafficking: A Shift in Attitudes", *AZ Central*, January 25, 2015, Accessed January 26 2015, <http://www.azcentral.com/story/life/az-narratives/2015/01/24/sex-trafficking-prostitution-police-attitudes/22300101/>

2c. Collective Data Sharing

One of the most pressing needs of all sectors addressing human trafficking is a system of standardized, shared data. The Asia Foundation recently noted in regards to their project in Cambodia, “*there is currently very little sharing of information due to the wide distribution of NGOs addressing the problem, the difficulty of communications in remote areas, low levels of information technology capacity in anti-trafficking groups, and the hesitancy to share sensitive information over insecure channels*”.³⁰ Public sector agencies that struggle with insecure channels of information sharing, should seek out private partners who could collaborate by contributing necessary resources to ensure secure sharing of data on a more widespread level. As the International Office of Migration states, “*collection, compilation and the reporting of key data, as well as research capacity building and evaluation of the impact of programmes are also essential elements needed to increase the knowledge base on human trafficking*”.³¹ Even in the rare event that national data collection efforts look to adopt standardized methodologies, there remains a lack of means by which data can be shared by varying and international anti-trafficking actors in a safe and secure manner. “*The resulting impact is that often the data gathered are not comparable and the potential for use is limited*.”³² The need for such a collective and collaborative data sharing system surpasses the resources that the public sector can provide without private sector partnerships.

An example of current cross-sector and cross-cultural collaboration is the NGO, La Strada International. La Strada International (LSI) is a European NGO network against trafficking in human persons that consists of eight member organizations that are all registered as independent NGOs and work primarily at the grassroots level.³³ La Strada is unique in that its member organizations work together as the decision-making organ of the network and collectively elect policies, board members and their international secretariat. The international secretariat, based in Amsterdam is responsible for maintaining and expanding relations, producing shared policies and action plans and harmonizing advocacy programs between organizations and countries. By sharing information, resources and big-picture strategic goals, La Strada is able to coordinate (not duplicate) efforts in all 3Ps areas through their utilization of horizontal partnership.

In 2005 La Strada International decided to expand their philosophy of partnership and launched the La Strada International NGO Platform that “*aims to strengthen the cooperation in Europe (both EU and Non EU) between civil society organisations that combine practical work with trafficked persons and affected groups with political advocacy for human rights based policies to eradicate trafficking in human beings*”.³⁴ La Strada International NGO Platform is made up of more than 20 NGOs and three networks from over 20 European (EU and non-EU) countries. The platform meets for two days every two years to discuss current challenges and

³⁰ University of Southern California. “Technology& Human Trafficking”. 2011. Accessed January 26, 2015. <http://technologyandtrafficking.usc.edu/report/future-action-for-trafficking-online/>

³¹ International Organization for Migration. “Counter Trafficking: IOM’s Approach”. Accessed January 25, 2015 from: <http://www.iom.int/cms/countertrafficking>

³² International Organization for Migration. “Counter Trafficking.”

³³ La Strada International, accessed January 10, 2015, <http://lastradainternational.org/>.

³⁴ La Strada International, accessed January 10, 2015, <http://lastradainternational.org/>.

opportunities in the field of combating human trafficking, and ends each session with Joint Actions committees in which partners discuss opportunities on national and international levels for collective advocacy and potential joint campaigns.

The example of La Strada International NGO Platform illustrates a coordinated effort to collaborate between NGOs, but has not yet expanded beyond the NGO sector by creating opportunities for government or private partners to contribute to the process. While LSI has been incredibly effective in sharing resources and working towards a shared data-system for European organizations working on combatting human trafficking, collaboration with the private sector or government agency could offer a breadth of resources to fund, design and implement such a comprehensive tracking system.

3. Education

3a. Educate the Public Responsibly (Responsible Advocacy)

The sensationalizing of sex trafficking information is often excused in the name of “raising awareness” and is often based on the false assumption that more awareness will lead to more anti-trafficking efforts. Such dramatized stories obscure the reality that trafficking occurs in many forms. And, because public understanding of sex trafficking is skewed, many find it difficult to identify “trafficking” and distinguish it from other illicit activities such as child labor, forced labor and prostitution.³⁵ Additionally, the dramatic accounts and individual stories of suffering presented by activists call into question the credibility of research findings that may indicate “*the field is more complex, and perhaps smaller or less brutal than previously assumed*”.³⁶ This discourse surrounding sex trafficking then makes it problematic for politicians to respond to research suggesting alternative understandings of trafficking or implementing appropriate criminal justice responses.

For example, the term “child trafficking” has often been used by both commentators and activists interchangeably with child prostitution and sex tourism, so much so that child trafficking has come to be seen almost entirely in the context of sexual exploitation.³⁷ This is not an accurate reflection of the many facets of child trafficking, and one needs to look no further than in the case of Thailand, where child trafficking could happen in the form of indentured labor toiling on farms (but without sexual exploitation), to girls and boys becoming debt bonded into brothels, or to street children selling sex in exchange for survival. It is also not uncommon to find that “*child prostitution exists as a family trade, when children living with their parents are sold for sex as part of the household economy*”.³⁸ Public understanding of the nature of child trafficking in Thailand is far from that, as evident in a simple Google image search of the terms “Child Sex Trafficking Thailand”. Results show image upon image of girls who are seemingly trapped in circumstances of forced prostitution, underscoring the harsh reality that

³⁵ Tyldum, Guri. "Limitations in Research on Human Trafficking." *International Migration* (2010)

³⁶ Tyldum, “Limitations in.”

³⁷ Montgomery, Heather, "Defining Child Trafficking & Child Prostitution: The Case of Thailand." *Seattle Journal for Social Justice*, 2011: 775-811

³⁸ “Montgomery, “Defining Child Trafficking”, 775

trafficking is a more complex phenomenon that does not necessarily equate to prostitution. When the misinformed public does make an effort to end human trafficking, they will often support policies and organizations that are ultimately counter-productive to the fight against human trafficking.³⁹ It is therefore imperative for these channels to act responsibly in their messaging to avoid fear mongering, and to present an accurate picture of the problem. One way to achieve this is through greater partnerships among the media, NGOs, and businesses. One of the most successful advocacy campaigns to date is “The Girl Effect”, a viral video prepared by the Nike Foundation (with the help of Nike’s outside advertising agencies) about the importance of educating girls in the developing world. Since its launch, the video has been shared more than 15 million times across the world.⁴⁰ It conveys clear, empirically based statistics in an easily digestible format without distorting the realities of the issue. The Girl Effect video and its subsequent viral popularity was made possible through a partnership that allowed NGOs to tell their story combined with the technical expertise of advertising agencies (previously unavailable to them) and the financial backing of the Nike Foundation. Engaging other sectors in responsible (i.e. non-sensationalized) advocacy and communication activities would allow the anti-trafficking message to reach a wider audience across broader sections of the population. This, in turn, would improve the overall visibility and effectiveness of global and local public awareness initiatives.

Equally important is the need to educate all those who may come in contact with victims from the victims themselves to law enforcement and government employees. This is especially evident in the case of voluntary repatriation - the 2010 Trafficking in Persons Report publicly doubted the data from prominent countries that boasted 100 percent rates of “voluntary repatriation” for foreign trafficking victims. Many victims of trafficking face violent retributions to themselves or their families if they return to the place they were originally trafficked from, social shame that bars them from ever truly reintegrating into their communities or the very real risk of being trafficked again. In the face of such despair, it is not surprising that many victims would chose to start a new life away from home, which is why 100 percent repatriation reports are suspicious. International cases of local jails and officials have been reported to have falsely represented or omitted to mention victims’ rights in regards to voluntary repatriation. As a result, the victim is returned to an unsafe environment or worse, delivered back into the vicious and violent cycle of trafficking. Furthermore, as the 2010 Trafficking in Persons report comments, “*when a country jails and repatriates victims without screening or protection, NGOs are deterred from bringing their clients to the government’s attention*”⁴¹ which only further deters comprehensive collaborations to happen between these two sectors.

³⁹ Turner, Ryan Beck. *HTC Blog*. Jan 21, 2014. <http://humantraffickingcenter.org/posts-by-htc-associates/how-not-to-talk-about-human-trafficking/>

⁴⁰ Kristof, Nicholas, and Sheryl WuDunn. "Charity." In *Nicholas Kristof; Sheryl WuDunn*, by Nicholas Kristof and Sheryl WuDunn, 167-182. New York: Alfred K. Knopf, 2014.

⁴¹ Trafficking in Persons Report, 2010, accessed January 27, 2015, <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/142979.pdf>

3b. Educate Victims Responsibly

Traditionally, NGOs have relied on basic reading and math skills, micro loans for small businesses and teaching victims “pink-collared” skills such as sewing and handicrafts, as a means to attain an independent livelihood. Despite these efforts, thousands of girls continue to be trafficked every year. It does not help that no reliable victim recidivism estimates exist which is, once again, due to the hidden nature of this crime and the lack of sufficient attention to it. The existing mismatch between counter-trafficking solutions and labor-market realities is most evident, however. Aside from failing to provide an adequately viable economic alternative, such ‘pink-collared’ skills do not enable victims to become competitive in today’s global economy. By 2020, it is estimated that in just the USA, the economy will demand 123 million high-skilled workers with strong backgrounds in science, technology, engineering and math.⁴² If victims are limited to traditional skill sets and basic reading and math skills, they will always be ‘playing catch-up’ while the world runs ahead at full speed.

With the reach and access of Massive Open Online Courses (MOOC) through virtual platforms such as Coursera and Khan Academy, the difficulty rests not so much in gaining the required knowledge, but ensuring that the knowledge gained is recognized by future employers. This is one of the unique characteristics of the Baha’i Institute of Higher Education (BIHE), a learning model that could be extended into the anti-trafficking space. The BIHE Learning Model utilizes a network of accredited educators who work and reside around the globe whose roles involve not just teaching globally over the internet but establishing formal relationships with other educational institutions for recognition and acceptance of BIHE courses and degrees. The commitment to gain formal recognition of BIHE courses has enabled BIHE graduates to secure graduate study placements in 79 prestigious universities and colleges in North America, Europe, Australia and Asia.⁴³ Subjects taught range from accounting to literature, social sciences and computer engineering. Using this model, the benefit of quality education could be extended to trafficking victims, where the breadth and depths of subjects offered would allow victims an education that goes beyond the rudimentary. Formal recognition of their academic journey would give them the opportunity to move beyond the poverty line and on to higher paying careers.

Conclusion

In a world that is no longer defined by borders, social problems such as human trafficking thrive in the coordinated structure of isolated silos. In order to effectively combat such a complex issue, we must be willing to blur the lines between public service and private profit. The above recommendations illustrate that multi-sector partnership is imperative in the fight against human trafficking. It must be noted that the success of increased collaborations

⁴² Shorenstein, Marissa, and Reshma Saujani, “*Be our guest: the city’s schools system needs to prioritize science, technology, engineering and math (stem) education*”, last modified Dec 16, 2013, accessed January 20 2015, <http://girlswhocode.com/be-our-guest-the-citys-schools-system-needs-to-prioritize-science-technology-engineering-and-math-stem-education/>.

⁴³ Baha’i Institute of Higher Education, “*Welcome and Overview*”, accessed January 20 2015. <http://www.bihe.org>

also depends on the areas of engagement within which partnerships operate, the employment of a risk assessment process, and a robust monitoring and evaluation system to measure the outcome and impact of collaborations.

We recognize this paper has its limitations and it is inevitable that more will surface as new research methodologies and reporting mechanisms evolve. One area requiring further research is the “virtualization” of human trafficking. With the proliferation of online websites such as Backpage.com and similar platforms offering escort services, the internet is fast becoming a tool exploited by sex traffickers, who hide behind the anonymity the virtual world offers in order to pimp out their victims to the World Wide Web. These, in addition to a host of other challenges, require a concerted effort that focuses on both the demand and supply of the trade in humans in a manner that can propel concrete, sustainable action.

Based on the findings of this paper, we believe that strategic multi-sector collaborations that champion level 5 leadership, collaborative cooperation and responsible education are the missing pieces of the puzzle. In its essence, partnership reflects the ability to see beyond our individual needs and work towards a comprehensive collaboration that extends beyond borders, profit, pride and designated responsibility. Restoring dignity to those who have been stripped of their very humanity calls for courageous, compassionate action that cannot be accomplished alone.

Bibliography

- Alameda County District Attorney's Office. The H.E.A.T Watch Blueprint. Alameda, California, January 12, 2015.
- Baha'i Institute of Higher Education. Welcome and Overview. January 2015. www.bihe.org (accessed January 2015).
- Bryson, John M., Barbara C. Crosby, and Melissa Middleton Stone. "The Design And Implementation Of Cross-Sector Collaborations: Propositions From The Literature." *Public Administration Review*, no. Special Issue (2006): 44-55. Retrieved from: https://www.hhh.umn.edu/people/jmbryson/pdf/cross_sector_collaborations.pdf
- CdeBaca, Luis. "The Global Fight Against Human Trafficking: Ten Years After Palermo." 2010 Remarks From the Office To Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. Oct 14, 2010. <http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/rm/2010/149474.htm> (accessed January 20, 2015).
- Chang, Sharon. "The Four Ps Paradigm". Funding Situation of Anti-Trafficking Organizations. Accessed January 27, 2015 from: <http://anti-traffickingorgfunding.weebly.com/4ps-framework.html>
- Crosby, Barbara and John M. Bryson. "Integrative Leadership And The Creation And Maintenance Of Cross-sector Collaborations." *The Leadership Quarterly*, no. 21 (2010): 211-30. Retrieved from: http://ac.els-cdn.com/S1048984310000226/1-s2.0-S1048984310000226-main.pdf?_tid=745e8c92-a5c8-11e4-ac8b-00000aacb362&acdnat=1422324289_1b5a836fbd49093416f15761b0fb4810
- Erickson, Amanda. "Here's Why We Can't Just Put Homeless Families in Foreclosed Homes." Business Insider. June 28, 2012.
- Esarey, David. Funding Priorities in Human Trafficking. Denver, Colorado, April 24, 2014.
- Fagan, Kevin. "S.F Takes New Direction on Homeless Camps with I-stop aid center." SF Gate. San Francisco, January 24, 2015.
- Federal Strategic Action Plan Services for Victims of Human Trafficking in the United States. "Coordination, Collaboration, Capacity". Published and printed by A/GIS/GPS, January 2014. Retrieved from: <http://www.ovc.gov/pubs/FederalHumanTraffickingStrategicPlan.pdf>

- Frey, Christine. *A Comprehensive Approach to Combating Human Trafficking in San Francisco*. Berkeley: Goldman School of Public Policy, 2010.
- Georgetown University. *Providers of Service to Victims of Trafficking: A Study for Catholic Charities USA*. Washington, D.C: Georgetown University Center for Applied Research, 2013.
- Global Business Alliance against Human Trafficking (gBCAT). Accessed January 25, 2015. <http://www.gbcat.org>
- Gore, Erin Morgan, and Breanna DiGiammarino. "Crowdfunding for Nonprofits." *Stanford Social Innovation Review*, 2014.
- Gupta, Ruchira. Apne Aap Women Worldwide. "*Protecting Victims of Trafficking and cross-border cooperation in prosecuting traffickers of persons*". Remarks made to the General Assembly Thematic Debate on human trafficking, June 3, 2008. Retrieved from: <http://www.un.org/ga/president/62/ThematicDebates/humantrafficking/apneaap.pdf>
- International Development Law Organization. "*Preventing and Combating the Trafficking of Girls in India Using Legal Empowerment Strategies: Rights Awareness and Legal Assistance Program in Four Districts of West Bengal*". June 2010 – March 2011, 1-37. Retrieved from: <http://www.idlo.org/Publications/FinalReportGirlsProject.pdf>
- International Organization for Migration. "Counter Trafficking: IOM's Approach". Accessed January 25, 2015 from: <http://www.iom.int/cms/countertrafficking>
- Kristof, Nicholas, and Sheryl WuDunn. "Charity." In Nicholas Kristof; Sheryl WuDunn, by Nicholas Kristof and Sheryl WuDunn, 167-182. New York: Alfred K. Knopf, 2014.
- La Strada International. "European Network Against Trafficking in Human Beings", accessed January 12, 2015. <http://lastradainternational.org/>
- Level Five Leadership: Achieving "Greatness" as a Leader*. MindTools.com. Accessed January 27, 2015, <http://www.mindtools.com/pages/article/level-5-leadership.htm>
- Montgomery, Heather. "Defining Child Trafficking & Child Prostitution: The Case of Thailand." *Seattle Journal for Social Justice*, 2011: 775-811.
- Palantir Technologies. "Impact Study: Helping to Find and Rescue Missing and Exploited Children." Palantir. January 2015. www.palantir.com/wp-content/static/pg-analysis-blog/2011/11/ImpactStudy_NCMEC.pdf3. (accessed January 2015).
- Polaris Project. "Shelter Beds For Human Trafficking Survivors in the United States." Polaris Project. June 2012. <http://www.ywcagreaterbaltimore.org/images/shelter%20beds%20for%20human%20trafficking%20survivors.pdf> (accessed January 2015). —. "Statistics by State." Polaris Project. December 2014. <http://www.traffickingresourcecenter.org/state/california> (accessed January 2015).
- Price, Susan. OLR Research Report . Hartford: Office of Legislative Research, 2012.
- Prosecuting Human Traffickers*, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. Accessed January 27, 2015 from: <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/prosecution.html>
- Ralph, Regan. Women's Rights Division, Human Rights Watch. "*Testimony before the Senate Committee on Foreign Relations Subcommittee on Near Eastern and South Asian Affairs*", February 22, 2000. Retrieved from: <http://www.hrw.org/news/2000/02/21/international-trafficking-women-and-children>
- Ruelas, Richard. AZ Central. January 25, 2015. <http://www.azcentral.com/story/life/az-narratives/2015/01/24/sex-trafficking-prostitution-police-attitudes/22300101/> (accessed January 26, 2015).
- Shelley, Louise. "Trafficking In Women: The Business Approach." *Brown Journal of World Affairs*, 2003: 119-131.
- Shorenstein, Marissa, and Reshma Saujani. BE OUR GUEST: THE CITY'S SCHOOLS SYSTEM NEEDS TO PRIORITIZE SCIENCE, TECHNOLOGY, ENGINEERING AND MATH (STEM) EDUCATION. Dec 16, 2013. <http://girlswhocode.com/be-our-guest-the-citys-schools-system-needs-to-prioritize-science-technology-engineering-and-math-stem-education/>.
- The Asia Foundation, "Utilizing Information Technology to Address Human Trafficking," n.d., <http://www.asiafoundation.org/pdf/trafficking-IT.pdf>

- Turner, Ryan Beck. HTC Blog. Jan 21, 2014. <http://humantraffickingcenter.org/posts-by-htc-associates/how-not-to-talk-about-human-trafficking/>
- Tyldum, Guri. "Limitations in Research on Human Trafficking." *International Migration*, 2010.
- U.S. Department of State, Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. *Trafficking in Persons Report 2007*. U.S. Department of State. June 2007. Accessed January 27, 2015, Web. <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/82902.pdf>
- U.S. Department of State, Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. *Trafficking in Persons Report 2010*. U.S. Department of State. June 2010. Accessed January 27, 2015, Web. <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/142979.pdf>
- U.S. Department of State, Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. "The 3Ps: Prevention, Protection, Prosecution". Washington DC, 2011. Accessed January 27, 2015. <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/167334.pdf>
- UN.GIFT. "007 Workshop: From Protection to Prosecution - A Strategic Approach." THE VIENNA FORUM TO FIGHT HUMAN TRAFFICKING . Vienna: UNODC, 2008. 2-7.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*. Vienna, Austria: United Nations Publications, 2014.
- University of Southern California. "Technology & Human Trafficking: Future Action for Trafficking Online." University of Southern California, a Project of the USC Annenberg Center on Communication Leadership & Policy. 2011. Retrieved from: <http://technologyandtrafficking.usc.edu/report/future-action-for-trafficking-online/>
- UNODC. Webinar panelists call for partnerships in efforts to combat trafficking globally. December 13, 2012. <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/2012/webinar-panellists-call-for-partnerships-in-efforts-to-combat-trafficking-globally.html>.
- UNODC. What is Human Trafficking? January 20, 2015. <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/what-is-human-trafficking.html>.